

Open Access Article

Evaluation of Tourism Policy Based on Local Knowledge: The Case of Lake Toba, Indonesia

Beny Octofryana Yousca Marpaung^{1*}, Dwira Nirfalini Aulia¹, Eric Witarsa², Felicia Tania²

¹ *Toba Lake & Sustainable Tourism Working Group, Monitoring Center for Sustainable Tourism, Architecture Department, Faculty of Engineering, Universitas Sumatera Utara, Medan, 20155, Indonesia*

² *Independent Researcher, Medan, Indonesia*

Received: October 11, 2021 ▪ Reviewed: November 23, 2021

▪ Accepted: December 18, 2021 ▪ Published: January 28, 2022

Abstract:

The Indonesian government should design policies to provide a socially inclusive and local knowledge-based tourism framework. Tourism policies are weak in promoting local knowledge-based tourism, contributing to economic turnover. Implementing local knowledge-based government policies is essential and strategic because it can trigger an increase in the economy of the people who occupy the seven regencies around the Lake Toba tourist attraction. The objective of this study is to analyze the application of tourism policies based on local knowledge in the buffer districts of the Lake Toba Region based on the social context that includes economic, government, political, and cultural facts. In collecting data, this study uses primary data and secondary data. This article presents the analysis of preliminary data and secondary data as a result of observation with a qualitative approach. Through qualitative methods, this study analyzes and interprets tourism policies on the facts of local knowledge. Policy observation focuses on exploring the reciprocal interactions that affect the implementation of tourism policies. The analysis of the evaluation of tourism development policies in this study found that the availability of supporting resources had not been allocated clearly. External conditions (social, economic, and political) hinder the implementation of local knowledge-based tourism policies effectively and optimally. In the future, this study should develop a mapping of local knowledge-based systems to establish a common understanding in the collective management of complex policy issues among stakeholders—mapping of local knowledge-based systems to support evaluation designs in sustainable tourism programs in the Lake Toba region.

Keywords: community, evaluation, local knowledge, policy, stakeholders, tourism.

基于当地知识的旅游政策评估：以印度尼西亚多巴湖为例

Corresponding Author: Beny Octofryana Yousca Marpaung, ST., MT., Ph.D., Toba Lake & Sustainable Tourism Working Group, Monitoring Center for Sustainable Tourism, Architecture Department, Faculty of Engineering, Universitas Sumatera Utara, Medan, 20155, Indonesia; email: beny.marpaung@usu.ac.id

This article is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution License (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0>)

摘要:

印度尼西亚政府应制定政策以提供具有社会包容性和以当地知识为基础的旅游框架。旅游政策在促进当地知识型旅游方面薄弱，导致经济周转。实施基于地方知识的政府政策至关重要且具有战略意义，因为它可以促进占据多巴湖旅游景点周围七个地区的人们的经济增长。本研究的目的是根据包括经济、政府、政治和文化事实在内的社会背景，分析基于当地知识的旅游政策在多巴湖地区缓冲区的应用。在收集数据时，本研究使用原始数据和次要数据。本文采用定性方法对初步数据和二次数据进行分析，作为观察的结果。通过定性方法，本研究根据当地知识的事实分析和解释旅游政策。政策观察侧重于探索影响旅游政策实施的相互作用。本研究对旅游发展政策评价的分析发现，配套资源的可得性没有得到明确的分配。外部条件（社会、经济和政治）阻碍了当地以知识为基础的旅游政策的有效和最佳实施。未来，本研究应开发基于当地知识的系统的映射，以在利益相关者之间对复杂政策问题的集体管理建立共识——映射基于当地知识的系统，以支持湖中可持续旅游项目的评估设计多巴地区。

关键词: 社区、评估、当地知识、政策、利益相关者、旅游业。

1. Introduction

In most developing countries, the tourism industry plays a crucial role in the local and global scale of economic development. Throughout each cabinet period, the tourism sector remains one of the focuses of government programs so that every region in Indonesia continues to have a sustainable tourism system, individually and as a whole. The government strengthens tourism as the leading sector through various policy forms, namely the law, Government regulation, presidential decrees, and regional regulation. Tourism policy implementation should ensure that infrastructure development leads to the progressive development of the tourism sector.

Sustainable tourism based on local knowledge forms a tourist destination's image to maintain competitiveness in domestic and global tourism markets, as it can reach cultural, social, economic, and political dimensions (Wahyuningrum et al., 2020). Human resources play an essential role in determining a successful tourism development. Hence, local community involvement becomes one of the primary considerations in the policymaking process to sustain tourism activities. In addition to human resources (socio-economic aspects), the concept of local knowledge in sustainable tourism development also involves the related tourist destination's natural and cultural values.

In 2020, Indonesian Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economy introduced Indonesia's five super-priority tourism destinations, including Lake Toba as the main attraction in North Sumatra. Lake Toba is designated as the North Sumatra tourism brand with a high potential to support Indonesia's tourism growth in the global tourism market. However, the flow of globalization becomes a challenge for local knowledge-based tourism (including Lake Toba) because it affects local cultural values through the flow of western values and tightens global competition. This phenomenon does not rule out the cultural erosion in the tourist destination

by foreign cultures. Thus, the government policies must emphasize tourism regulation based on local knowledge, especially in Lake Toba and the seven surrounding regencies.

Discussions on tourism planning should describe the implementation of policies translated into practice by tourism actors. Implementation of the policy refers to the relationship between Government involvement, local community involvement, and the actual outcomes. Policy implementation becomes a vital issue for the tourism sector in Lake Toba and the seven surrounding regencies because some regulations are not implemented or only implemented in the tourism industry. Seven regencies surround Lake Toba: Dairi Regency, Karo Regency, North Tapanuli Regency, Humbang Hasundutan Regency, Simalungun Regency, Toba Samosir Regency, and Samosir Regency. The leaders of the regencies have different ways of involvement in increasing domestic and foreign tourist visits. The issue discussed in this study is significant because it reflects Government's goals and intentions, and also the extent to which the government may act to advance its area bordering Lake Toba. Although this issue is significant, it turns out that research on tourism policy implementation has always been in a weak position.

The present study evaluates tourism policy implementation towards the current tourism industry system, including the local community in seven regencies surrounding Lake Toba. The analysis of tourism policy emphasizes the importance of studying the basis of the implementation plan, concerning the interaction of the government with the broader community within the tourist destination. Tourism planning in Lake Toba and the seven surrounding regencies shall comprehend policies related to local knowledge in terms of socio-economic, political, governance, and cultural contexts. Implementation of policies based on policies according to the organizational context that applies in a country (Pfadenhauer et al., 2017). The implementation of

tourism policies must be integrated into a country's decision-making process. However, the government must prioritize the people who occupy the area and link the interaction of the community context with the government decisions (Persson et al., 2018). Therefore, evaluation of tourism policies should examine its relationship between administrative organizations, community groups influenced by tourism policy, and its realization towards the community. This paper evaluates tourism policy from the local knowledge perspective as one of the potentials developed to attract more tourists to visit tourist attractions in Lake Toba and the seven surrounding regencies.

2. Local Knowledge and Tourism Policy

The tourism crisis within a tourist destination can be related to the local community's excessive dependence on tourism revenues, which requires tourism trust restoration management. Tourism management should improve disaster risk reduction to achieve comprehensive and integrated sustainable tourism development (Gurtner, 2016). The number of tourist visits often considered as an indicator of the competitive tourism system. Therefore, various factors must be examined in building and maintaining a sustainable tourism system.

In its implementation, the government as a policymaker must protect tourism resources from exploitation that destroys sustainability or other possible conflicts to maintain broader legitimacy among the community (Nugroho et al., 2018). Hence, the government regulates policies to support tourism development at various scales (national and local) by formulating objectives and setting priorities as stated in various forms of regulations (Farsari et al., 2007). This objective is explained in Law No. 10 of 2009, stipulating that travel activities conducted by an individual or a group visiting certain places have a purpose for recreation, personal development, or discover tourist attractions' uniqueness visited in a temporary period.

Wang et al. (2021) suggest that local knowledge-based tourism tends to be the suitable tourism model for tourist destinations dominated by village objects with diverse natural and cultural potential. Hence, the government should develop a thriving tourism sector through a complete, integrated, and participatory system approach concerning economic, technical, socio-cultural, energy-saving, nature, and environmental conservation criteria.

However, the involvement of political authorities alone is still the most common level of participation and is called empowerment in tourism development. Political participation analysis must pay attention to the context of the local wisdom of the community in the tourist destination area (Bauto, 2016). Aside from mass tourism management, the policies set must respect cultural ethics and minimize the adverse impacts on the environment (Chong, 2020). As a tourism stakeholder who has the authority to design policies, the

government must plan an effective and integrated sustainable tourism concept with every tourism stakeholder. The idea of sustainable tourism development must accommodate responsiveness to cultural contexts and linkages with existing institutional frameworks and even be open to being in an international collaborative context (Chamidah et al., 2020).

In the context of sustainable tourism, community-based tourism is a system that empowers the tourist destination's primary and supporting resources by involving local communities' participation as human resources and the main drivers of the tourism sector in a tourist destination. In other words, community-based tourism implements local knowledge values capable of reaching socio-cultural and economic dimensions in a sustainable tourism system (Juma & Khademi-Vidra, 2019).

Several studies have found that local communities in developing and less developed areas, such as rural destinations, often prefer to be minimally involved in tourism development (Kala & Bagri, 2018; Wondirad & Ewnetu, 2019). For the local communities, tourism is only a sector to depend on for the economy. Community participation should be designed to enable sustainable tourism development in leading tourist attractions, even though the implementation often has many interpretations (Martini et al., 2017). Community involvement in tourism destinations and the perceived economic benefits have the most significant influence on tourism development. Sustainable tourism planning and development depend on the extensive involvement of local communities (Rasoolimanesh & Jaafar, 2016).

The government must design various achievement strategies that involve the community as subjects so that tourism development can sustainably take place. The design of the achievement strategy must be based on a study of local knowledge of tourist destinations so that the community involvement design can run effectively (Pan et al., 2018). In achieving a sustainable tourism system, community empowerment must be the primary key to the success of tourism development because the potential strength of the community in developed tourist destinations can encourage local communities to maintain their culture and nature (Khalid et al., 2019).

3. Study Sites and Methods

3.1. Study Site

Researchers conducted the study in Lake Toba and the seven surrounding regencies in North Sumatera, Indonesia (Figure 1). Lake Toba's uniqueness characterizes the tourist destination as a lake with Samosir Island in the middle of the lake, surrounded by geosites and grasslands which sustain the natural environment, including the variety of flora and fauna. In addition to managing tourist attractions near Lake Toba, local communities are also involved in managing souvenir shops located in several cultural attractions in Parapat, Tomok Village, and Tuktuk Village. Due to its

natural and cultural diversity, this tourist destination has become Indonesia's leading international tourism destination.



Figure 1. Tourist map of Lake Toba area and seven surrounding regencies

As one of UNESCO Global Geoparks and Indonesia's super-priority tourism destinations, Lake Toba aims to present itself as the “Monaco of Asia”. Therefore, the tourism industry in the research area has to sustain its tourism activities. Therefore, Lake Toba and the seven surrounding regencies become suitable sites to analyze the tourism policy system within the tourist destination area to achieve environmental, cultural, and socio-economic sustainability.

3.2. Methods

The present study uses a qualitative method with a descriptive approach by conducting several methods in data collection and analysis. First, the primary data was obtained from direct observation in the research site to collect data related to facts of local knowledge in the area around Lake Toba. Secondly, an in-depth informal interview was conducted with the former Pangururan Regency Tourism Office to obtain data related to tourism development in Lake Toba, especially in the Samosir Regency. Finally, researchers obtained secondary data from various published and unpublished sources on local knowledge-based tourism policies applied in the research area. These data include government policy documents, annual reports on tourism statistics, and community-based tourism-related reports. Specifically, the policies discussed in this paper include Law No. 10 of 2009, Government Regulation No.36 of 2010, Minister of Forestry Regulation No.4 of 2012, and focuses more on North Sumatra Regional Regulation number 5 of 2018 that applies on a regional scale. In addition, the data on tourism statistics and tourist facilities are also collected from North Sumatra's Central Bureau of Statistics to support the facts of the Lake Toba tourism industry.

The primary and secondary data collected were then analyzed and interpreted in achieving the research objectives. This idea emphasizes the importance of

analyzing policies concerning the more expansive community environment to implement policy based on environmental, socio-economic, and cultural contexts (Ajibade, 2019).

4. Results and Discussion

At each stage of sustainable tourism planning, different levels of coordination between policymakers should address and accommodate various considerations. Thus, the government regulates policies to support tourism development at multiple scales (national and local) by formulating goals and setting priorities as outlined in various regulations (Wu & Tsai, 2016). Following the stipulation of North Sumatra as a national tourism brand, local governments' role in regulating tourism policies is stated in the North Sumatra Province Regional Regulation No. 5 of 2018 on Master Plan for Tourism Development of North Sumatra Province for 2017-2025. Law No. 10 of 2009 claims that travel activities conducted by an individual or a group visiting certain places have a purpose for recreation, personal development, or discover tourist attractions' uniqueness visited in a temporary period. Therefore, local governments' tourism policies in the seven regencies surrounding Lake Toba must be adjusted based on local knowledge so that tourists can fulfill their travel purposes. The central and regional governments have obligations in tourism development under the contents of Law No. 10 of 2009 to maintain, develop, and conserve national assets that consist of tourist attractions and any undiscovered potential tourism assets.

One possible response to the current tourism challenges is to incorporate the concept of local community based-tourism in Lake Toba tourism sector. Jaelani (2017) states that tourism development based on local knowledge will contribute to the sustainability of tourist destinations that make diverse natural and cultural potentials superior objects. The government must socialize this model as a development concept that impacts the sustainability of a priority destination in a region. North Sumatra Regional Regulation No. 5 of 2018 stipulates that the Provincial Tourism Strategic Area is an area that serves the purposes of tourism as the primary function. A Provincial Tourism Strategic Area can boost regional tourism development by strongly influencing economic, social, and cultural growth, empowerment of natural resources, environmental carrying capacity, also defense and security systems. The Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economic encourages people to utilize local knowledge as a fundamental concept in their respective regions to build sustainable tourism in maintaining tourism competitiveness.

Aside from mass tourism management, the policies set must respect cultural ethics and minimize the adverse impacts on the environment (Chong, 2020). The concept of sustainable development that shows the importance of cultural sensitivity and its relationship with the use of political and institutional frameworks is

a fundamental aspect of future tourism planning in the Lake Toba destination in maintaining the social welfare of the local population. The government of seven regencies surrounding Lake Toba must develop mass tourism to positively affect the community's economic life in tourism attractions, local business governance, culture, heritage, and local traditions. North Sumatra Regional Regulation No. 5 of 2018 on the Master Plan for Tourism Development of North Sumatra Province for 2017-2025 stipulates that the development of tourist attractions in the Lake Toba area and seven surrounding regencies is carried out by: (1) Upholding religious and cultural values; (2) Developing conservation efforts to preserve the environment; (3) Developing attraction management to create quality and competitive tourist attractions; (4) Developing tourism-aware communities. The development of a complete tourism system depends on local knowledge of each district around the Lake Toba tourist attraction. The regional regulation specifically planned tourism development programs to create comprehensive tourism activities involving all tourism stakeholders in Lake Toba and the seven surrounding regencies (Table 1).

Table 1. North Sumatra tourist destination and tourism industry development program based on regional tourism policy (North Sumatra Regional Regulation No. 5 of 2018)

Local knowledge aspects	Program	Actions
Environmental	Responsibility towards surrounding environment	a. Develop cultural and artistic institutions at provincial and district levels. b. Utilize tangible and intangible cultural assets as a scheduled tourist attraction.
Cultural	Development of cultural tourist attraction	a. Develop cultural and artistic institutions at provincial and district levels. b. Utilize tangible and intangible cultural assets as a scheduled tourist attraction. c. Arrange cultural and artistic attractions schedule (event calendars) at provincial and regency levels. d. Protect, develop, and utilize cultural heritage as a tourist attraction.
Socio-economic	Development of tourism business partnership	a. Develop a work cooperation scheme between the Government, Provincial Government, Regency Government, tourism business enterprises, and local community within every priority tourism destination. b. Monitor and evaluate the cooperation scheme's effectiveness between the

Local knowledge aspects	Program	Actions
	Establishment of business credibility	Government, Provincial Government, Regency Government, tourism business enterprises, and local community within every priority tourism destination. a. Carry out standardization and certification on tourism businesses, referring to the international tourism principle in all regencies. b. Carry out standardization and certification on professional tourism careers. c. Build a network for safe and reliable electronic-based transactions. d. Develop a guaranteed business model for micro, small and medium enterprises within creative tourism industries to gain funding access.

Infrastructure development in the tourism industry adapts natural resource management principles by considering aspects of the surrounding environment. The utilization of land use for recreation contributes to human activities that affect landscape diversity (Izakovičová et al., 2019). The form of landscape diversity that impacts the many types of human activities affects the perception of visitors to a destination. Therefore, the development of natural tourism cannot be separated from the applicable regulations as stipulated in Government Regulation No. 36 of 2010 and Minister of Forestry Regulation No. 4 of 2012 on Natural Tourism Exploitation in Wildlife Sanctuaries, National Parks, Grand Forest Parks, and Natural Tourism Parks. In realizing the branding of Lake Toba as the "Monaco of Asia", the government has taken several strategic steps in 2017: (1) Cleaning up Lake Toba; (2) Infrastructure investment in the construction of roads, electricity, and internet; (3) Expanding Silangit Airport; (4) Opening tenders for the construction of ten hotels for four national companies, four foreign companies, and two state-owned enterprises; (5) Developing small and medium tourism enterprises with small gaps of competition management within the local tourism business. However, these efforts are insufficient because there are still some problems that arise in the development stage of tourism in Lake Toba, including: (1) The lack of connecting infrastructure related to tourist mobility (accessibility); (2) The short number of investors in building public facilities and infrastructure for tourists (amenities); (3) The quality of tourism products to be promoted and

marketed (attractions).

Tourism often allocates large energy consumption for movable assets (vehicles) and fixed assets (such as accommodation facilities, restaurants, and other buildings). Inefficient energy use and improper solid waste management will lead to adverse environmental, economic, and social impacts. Thus, the government's role in planning to increase public knowledge and initiatives to involve local communities is essential to effectively implement waste management programs (Fernando, 2019). Law No. 18 of 2008 on Waste Management stipulates that waste management is a systematic, comprehensive, and sustainable activity. Hence, the government must develop a work program that solves weaknesses in handling waste by involving all tourism stakeholders. One effective solution is an integrated waste management system that involves more community participation, environmentally friendly, energy-saving, or cost-efficient, and can productively increase community economic empowerment.

In addition to environmental conservation, tourism business management must also lead to cultural preservation. Cultural characteristics have an essential role in the tourism development of strategic tourism areas because these cultural values may become preferred regional values to tourists, hence increase the tourist destination's competitiveness (Ratanapongtra et al., 2020). The development and utilization of regional cultural heritage as a tourist attraction follows the laws and regional regulations. One of them is described in North Sumatra Regional Regulation No. 5 of 2018, which stipulates that the development of cultural tourist attractions is carried out by: (1) Developing cultural and artistic institutions; (2) Utilizing cultural assets as a scheduled tourist attraction; (3) Arranging cultural events; (4) Protecting, developing and utilizing regional cultural heritage as a tourist attraction. Lake Toba and the seven surrounding regencies are famous for their cultural distinctiveness, as the local community passed down their noble values and history from generation to generation. One of them is the traditional Batak house named Hutabolon. There are also Tomok and Tuktuk tourist villages, which serve as heritage sites of the Batak kings. To this day, the local community still carries out the conventional cultural system, which becomes an attraction for tourists interested in learning the local culture firsthand.

The socio-economic aspect in the context of sustainable tourism is related to the role of human resources in carrying out tourism activities, both as tourism stakeholders and tourism actors. The government, tourism businesses, and community participation in the tourism development path are significant to achieve sustainable tourism implementation within the tourism industry (Manaf et al., 2018). The role of local communities occupying the seven regencies surrounding Lake Toba in tourism businesses is diverse, mainly in managing tourist attractions or selling at souvenir markets.

Regarding socio-economic aspects, community-based tourism encourages the local community to participate in tourism planning and development stages actively. In other words, community-based tourism implements local knowledge values that can reach socio-cultural and economic dimensions in a sustainable tourism system (Juma & Khademi-Vidra, 2019). Every Indonesia tourism regulation stipulates that tourism in each region adapts the *Sapta Pesona* as a national tourism identity. This notion defines the tourism awareness related to local communities' role in creating conducive environment and atmosphere that encourages the tourism industry's growth and development through the embodiment of safe, orderly, clean, calm, beautiful, friendly, and memorable elements into tourism activities. Implementation of local knowledge aspects in the research area requires all tourism stakeholders' involvement in tourism development within Lake Toba and the seven surrounding regencies. This tourism system that focuses on the socio-cultural dimension is ideal for Lake Toba and the seven surrounding regencies as a developing area with high natural potential and human resources.

Developing socio-economic aspects to support planning to increase the number of tourists cannot be seen as a small problem. The participation of local communities that contributes to many interpretations allows developing sustainable tourism in the pre-eminent areas (Bonzanigo et al., 2016). Community involvement in tourism destinations and the perceived economic benefits have the most significant influence on tourism development. Sustainable tourism planning and development depend on the extensive involvement of local communities (Rasoolimanesh & Jaafar, 2016). Some residents occupying the seven regencies surrounding Lake Toba depend entirely on tourism-based income. However, they have various understandings about the selling value of tourism in the research area. Suppose the community is involved in making decisions regarding tourism development. In that case, the community must first understand the tourism development process to analyze tourists' needs and desires and offer various development alternatives to the tourism industry. Some residents still lack knowledge concerning the expectations of tourists who visit Lake Toba. For example, in Parbaba Dolok tourist village located in Pangururan Regency, some tourists feel uncomfortable because of the limited number and sanitation of public toilets. The local communities only welcome tourists amid the broad society and engage with them to benefit from tourism income. Residents tend to think that tourism should provide profits by selling handicrafts sourced from their efforts in the tourism business. This fact illustrates that the local community still has exceptionally minimal knowledge of tourism management.

The role of the government that includes stakeholders in planning various achievement strategies to involve the community as subjects is essential for sustainable tourism development (Martins, 2018). One

of the keys to the success of tourism development is community empowerment because this aspect encourages local communities to maintain culture and nature in prime destinations. This development strategy has the potential to achieve a sustainable tourism system (Rachmawati & Fountain, 2020).

Policies that respond to cultural facts and institutional frameworks can become a sustainable development concept whose implementation is planned following the international collaborative context (Leal Filho et al., 2018). Empowerment of local communities in the context of realizing a tourism-aware community is programmed in North Sumatra Regional Regulation No. 5 of 2018, by: (1) Strengthening local community institutions in a tourist destination to encourage community roles and participation in the tourism development process; (2) Forming tourist village in every Priority Tourism Destinations and Tourism Strategic Area; (3) Encouraging tourism-based planning at the sub-district and village levels; (4) Establishing an integrated tourism education and training center for local communities; (5) Strengthening information access and networking technologies for micro, small and medium enterprises, and tourism business at the regional, national and international levels.

Residents' knowledge of tourism objects comes from experience, guides, and tourism awareness group programs from the government. In the tourism awareness campaign policy, the government emphasizes the importance of being a good host. The government must educate the public, and policies regarding empowerment must also support residents in tourist attractions.

In addition, the role of the community, tourism institutions managed by the government, and the private sector, must also play a role in the development of sustainable tourism. Planning community involvement programs and tourism stakeholders in leading tourist attractions must create "Fair Destinations," which are essential for the success of tourism development (Edgell, 2019). Law No. 10 of 2009 on Tourism claims that everyone has the right to be involved in tourism development efforts. The local government is authorized to coordinate the performance of tourism stakeholders in the context of implementing sustainable tourism.

5. Conclusion

The government's role in the tourism sector is vital in planning and implementing regional tourism policies.

The implementation of tourism policies within Lake Toba and seven surrounding regencies has been going well. However, there are still several problems found in the tourism system. Some obstacles include lack of public awareness and participation in planning or implementing tourism activities, lack of competence in implementing tourism policies, lack of synergy between tourism stakeholders, and lack of attention towards environmental sustainability in Lake Toba and the seven surrounding regencies. On the other hand, the high

commitment of local political leaders and high tourism resources become factors that support the general tourism policy system. The government in charge of policy must coordinate all stages of tourism planning and development. However, the government's efforts to implement policy into the local community system are still ineffective and wrong-targeted.

Bonzanigo et al. (2016) also mention that the paradigm of community participation has become the mantra of sustainable tourism. The obstacles to community involvement in the tourism system of Lake Toba and the surrounding seven regencies include lack of knowledge, confidence, funds/capital, and skills. As mentioned in local tourism policies, the government is responsible for educating the local community, and the local community is obligated to support the implementation of tourism policies. The community needs to be fully involved in tourism activities.

The natural and cultural potential is the tourism added value that all tourism stakeholders must manage in Lake Toba and the seven surrounding regencies. However, the government seems incapable of implementing tourism policies, as this allows tourism managers to manage tourist attractions without setting quality standards. The negligence of tourism managers in their duty also impacts the local community to ignore the importance of the tourism sector in Lake Toba and the seven surrounding regencies. As one of the main stakeholders of Lake Toba's tourism activities, most local communities are still less concerned with environmental sustainability. Even though there are actions to improve tourist facilities quality in tourist attractions within Lake Toba and the seven surrounding regencies, this paradigm leads to the pollution of the tourist attraction area by the tourism actors' negligence towards tourism waste management. In addition to empowering local communities in the tourism industry, the government must also further improve nature conservation-based policies so that all tourism actors are willing to comply with the rules to help maintain cleanliness, safety, and quality assurance within the tourist destination.

Tourism should bring pride and confidence because policy identity reinforces it. The government must directly involve in realize programs designated in tourism policies to balance all tourism actors' roles in promoting local tourism.

6. Limitations and Further Study

As an archipelagic country, Indonesia has a government system with a decentralized model. Leading tourist destinations in priority tourism areas have many sub-districts requiring a particular approach to implementing policies. Implementing tourism policies in the sub-districts that border the Lake Toba area must pay special attention to the potential and social capital to realize community welfare. Researchers have difficulty understanding institutional practices that can create more equitable interest through tourism activities. The institutional system in

implementing policies in tourist destinations in the Lake Toba area must synergize between institutions and the community through stakeholders or policymakers who are directly involved in finding partnerships and patterns of government organization relevant to the conditions of the sub-districts that boundary the region of Lake Toba. This research can be continued by creating a concept that emphasizes the role of each element in the process from beginning to end in a policy so that it can be integrated and executed in synergy. In the practice of development in tourism, it is essential to understand the organizational culture in the sub-districts that border the Lake Toba area to facilitate the implementation of tourism destination development program patterns in carrying out tourism activities in the sub-district.

Acknowledgments

During the research process, the authors acknowledge the support of the community in attractions in seven districts around the Lake Toba tourist region. The researcher would like to thank the seven governments of the district Samosir who helped in obtaining secondary data to complete the required primary data. The source of research costs regarding "Evaluation of Tourism Policy Based on Local Knowledge: The Case of Lake Toba, Indonesia" comes from the Deputy for Research and Development Strengthening; Ministry of Research and Technology/National Agency for Research and Innovation in Fiscal Year 2021, Indonesia, in accordance with Amendment to Research Contract Number: 135/UN5.2.3.1/PPM/KP-DRPM/2021, 17 March 2021.

Authors' Contributions

Beny Octofryana Yousca Marpaung, as the first author, contributed to designing research problems that became the background of the importance of evaluating tourism policies in the Lake Toba region of Indonesia.

Dwira Nirfalini Aulia, as the second author, contributed to analyzing and discussing the facts of tourism policy and its implementation.

Beny Octofryana Yousca Marpaung and Dwira Nirfalini Aulia evaluate tourism policies based on local knowledge and design research methods.

Eric Witarsa, as the third author, contributed to tracing references related to secondary data on tourism policies and integrating them into facts on the field.

Felicia Tania, as the fourth author, contributed to collecting references, analyzing related theories, and making conclusions.

References

- [1] AJIBADE, I. (2019). Planned retreat in Global South megacities: disentangling policy, practice, and environmental justice. *Climatic Change*, 157(2), 299-317. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10584-019-02535-1>
- [2] BAUTO, L.M. (2016). Socio-cultural values as community local wisdom katoba muna in the development of learning materials social studies and history. *Historia: Jurnal Pendidik dan Peneliti Sejarah*, 14(2), 195-218. <http://dx.doi.org/10.17509/historia.v14i2.2027>
- [3] BONZANIGO, L., GIUPPONI, C., & BALBI, S. (2016). Sustainable tourism planning and climate change adaptation in the Alps: A case study of winter tourism in mountain communities in the Dolomites. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 24(4), 637-652. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09669582.2015.1122013>
- [4] CHAMIDAH, N., GUNTORO, B., & SULASTRI, E. (2020). Marketing communication and synergy of Pentahelix strategy on satisfaction and sustainable tourism. *The Journal of Asian Finance, Economics, and Business*, 7(3), 177-190. <https://doi.org/10.13106/jafeb.2020.vol7.no3.177>
- [5] CHONG, K.L. (2020). The side effects of mass tourism: the voices of Bali islanders. *Asia Pacific Journal of Tourism Research*, 25(2), 157-169. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/10941665.2019.1683591>
- [6] EDGELL, D.L. (2019). *Managing sustainable tourism: A legacy for the future*. London: Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780429318122>
- [7] FARSARI, Y., BUTLER, R.W., & PRASTACOS, P. (2007). Sustainable tourism policy for Mediterranean destinations: issues and interrelationships. *International Journal of Tourism Policy*, 1(1), 58-78. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780429318122>
- [8] FERNANDO, R.L.S. (2019). Solid waste management of local governments in the Western Province of Sri Lanka: An implementation analysis. *Waste Management*, 84, 194-203. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.wasman.2018.11.030>
- [9] GURTNER, Y. (2016). Returning to paradise: Investigating issues of tourism crisis and disaster recovery on the island of Bali. *Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Management*, 28, 11-19. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jhtm.2016.04.007>
- [10] IZAKOVIČOVÁ, Z., MIKLÓS, L., & ŠPULEROVÁ, J. (2019). Basic principles of sustainable land use management. In: MUELLER, L., & EULENSTEIN, F. (eds.) *Current Trends in Landscape Research*. Cham: Springer, pp. 395-423.
- [11] JAELANI, A. (2017). Halal tourism industry in Indonesia: Potential and prospects. *International Review of Management and Marketing*, 7(3), 25-34. Retrieved from <https://econjournals.com/index.php/irmm/article/view/4352>
- [12] JUMA, L.O., & KHADEMI-VIDRA, A. (2019). Community-based tourism and sustainable development of rural regions in Kenya; perceptions of the citizenry. *Sustainability*, 11(17), 4733. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su11174733>
- [13] KALA, D., & BAGRI, S.C. (2018). Barriers to local community participation in tourism

- development: Evidence from mountainous state Uttarakhand, India. *Tourism: An International Interdisciplinary Journal*, 66(3), 318-333. Retrieved from <https://hrcaj.srce.hr/clanak/303072>
- [14] KHALID, S., AHMAD, M. S., RAMAYAH, T., HWANG, J., & KIM, I. (2019). Community empowerment and sustainable tourism development: The mediating role of community support for tourism. *Sustainability*, 11(22), 6248. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su11226248>
- [15] LEAL FILHO, W., BRANDLI, L.L., BECKER, D., SKANAVIS, C., KOUNANI, A., SARDI, C., PAPAIOANNIDOU, D., PAÇO, A., AZEITEIRO, U., DE SOUSA, L.O., RAATH, S., PRETORIUS, R.W., SHIEL, C., VARGAS, V., TRENCHER, G., & MARANS, R.W. (2018). Sustainable development policies as indicators and pre-conditions for sustainability efforts at universities: Fact or fiction? *International Journal of Sustainability in Higher Education*, 19(1), 85-113. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJSHE-01-2017-0002>
- [16] MANAF, A., PURBASARI, N., DAMAYANTI, M., APRILIA, N., & ASTUTI, W. (2018). Community-based rural tourism in inter-organizational collaboration: How does it work sustainably? Lessons learned from Nglangeran Tourism Village, Gunungkidul Regency, Yogyakarta, Indonesia. *Sustainability*, 10(7), 2142. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su10072142>
- [17] MARTINI, U., BUFFA, F., & NOTARO, S. (2017). Community participation, natural resource management and the creation of innovative tourism products: Evidence from Italian networks of reserves in the Alps. *Sustainability*, 9(12), 2314. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su9122314>
- [18] MARTINS, M. (2018). Tourism planning and tourismphobia: An analysis of the strategic tourism plan of Barcelona 2010–2015. *Journal of Tourism, Heritage & Services Marketing*, 4(1), 3-7. <http://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.1247519>
- [19] NUGROHO, K., CARDEN, F., & ANTLOV, H. (2018). *Local Knowledge Matters: Power, Context and Policy Making in Indonesia*. Bristol: Policy Press. <http://doi.org/10.1332/policypress/9781447348078.001.0001>
- [20] PAN, S.Y., GAO, M., KIM, H., SHAH, K.J., PEI, S.L., & CHIANG, P.C. (2018). Advances and challenges in sustainable tourism toward a green economy. *Science of the Total Environment*, 635, 452-469. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2018.04.134>
- [21] PERSSON, J., JOHANSSON, E.L., & OLSSON, L. (2018). Harnessing local knowledge for scientific knowledge production: challenges and pitfalls within evidence-based sustainability studies. *Ecology and Society*, 23(4), 38. <https://doi.org/10.5751/ES-10608-230438>
- [22] PFADENHAUER, L.M., GERHARDUS, A., MOZYGEMBA, K., LYSDAHL, K.B., BOOTH, A., HOFMANN, B., WAHLSTER, P., POLUS, S., BURNS, J., BRERETON, L., & REHFUESS, E. (2017). Making sense of complexity in context and implementation: the Context and Implementation of Complex Interventions (CICI) framework. *Implementation Science*, 12(1), 21. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s13012-017-0552-5>
- [23] RACHMAWATI, E., & FOUNTAIN, J. (2020). Role of External Stakeholders in Tourism Development and Community Empowerment. *International Journal of Applied Sciences in Tourism and Events*, 4(1), 25-36. <http://dx.doi.org/10.31940/ijaste.v4i1.1640>
- [24] RASOOLIMANESH, S.M., & JAAFAR, M. (2016). Residents' perception toward tourism development: A pre-development perspective. *Journal of Place Management and Development*, 9(1), 91-104. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JPM-10-2015-0045>
- [25] RATANAPONGTRA, T., KHAMKERD, T., KONGDIT, S., & NAWATNATEE, T. (2020). Value creation of local identity in Thailand: Marketing promotion for enhancing community-based cultural tourism. *International Journal of Innovation, Creativity and Change*, 13(6), 475-488. Retrieved from https://www.ijicc.net/images/vol_13/Iss_6/13649_Ratanapongtra_2020_E_R.pdf
- [26] WAHYUNINGRUM, I.F.S., OKTAVILIA, S., & UTAMI, S. (2020). Developing Tourism Potentials: Evidence from Semawis Night Market. *Journal of Southwest Jiaotong University*, 55(6). <https://doi.org/10.35741/issn.0258-2724.55.6.16>
- [27] WANG, N., FANG, M., BEAUCHAMP, M., JIA, Z., & ZHOU, Z. (2021). An indigenous knowledge-based sustainable landscape for mountain villages: The Jiabang rice terraces of Guizhou, China. *Habitat International*, 111, 102360. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.habitatint.2021.102360>
- [28] WONDIRAD, A., & EWNETU, B. (2019). Community participation in tourism development as a tool to foster sustainable land and resource use practices in a national park milieu. *Land Use Policy*, 88, 104155. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.landusepol.2019.104155>
- [29] WU, C.C., & TSAI, H.M. (2016). Capacity building for tourism development in a nested social-ecological system — A case study of the South Penghu Archipelago Marine National Park, Taiwan. *Ocean & Coastal Management*, 123, 66-73. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ocecoaman.2016.02.001>

参考文献:

- [1] 阿吉巴德, I. (2019 年)。全球南方特大城市的计划撤退: 解开政策、实践和环境正义。气候变化, 157 (2), 299-317。 <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10584-019-02535-1>
- [2] BAUTO, L.M. (2016)。社会文化价值观作为社区

- 地方智慧卡托巴穆纳在学习材料社会研究和历史的发展。历史：中国历史教育与研究人员杂志，14(2)，195-218。
<http://dx.doi.org/10.17509/historia.v14i2.2027>
- [3] BONZANIGO, L., GIUPPONI, C. 和 BALBI, S. (2016)。阿尔卑斯山的可持续旅游规划和气候变化适应：多洛米蒂山区冬季旅游案例研究。可持续旅游杂志，24 (4)，637-652。
<https://doi.org/10.1080/09669582.2015.1122013>
- [4] CHAMIDAH, N., GUNTORO, B. 和 SULASTRI, E. (2020)。五螺旋战略在满意度和可持续旅游方面的营销传播和协同作用。亚洲金融、经济和商业杂志，7(3)，177-190。
<https://doi.org/10.13106/jafeb.2020.vol7.no3.177>
- [5] 钟，K.L. (2020年)。大众旅游的副作用：巴厘岛岛民的声音。亚太旅游研究杂志，25(2)，157-169。
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/10941665.2019.1683591>
- [6] EDGELL, D.L. (2019)。管理可持续旅游：未来的遗产。伦敦：劳特里奇。
<https://doi.org/10.4324/9780429318122>
- [7] 法萨里，Y., 巴特勒，R.W., & PRASTACOS, P. (2007)。地中海目的地的可持续旅游政策：问题和相互关系。国际旅游政策杂志，1 (1)，58-78。
<https://doi.org/10.4324/9780429318122>
- [8] 费尔南多，R.L.S. (2019)。斯里兰卡西部省地方政府固体废物管理：实施分析。废物管理，84，194-203。
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.wasman.2018.11.030>
- [9] 古特纳，Y. (2016年)。回归天堂：巴厘岛旅游危机和灾后恢复问题调查。酒店与旅游管理杂志，28，11-19。
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jhtm.2016.04.007>
- [10] IZAKOVIČOVÁ, Z., MIKLÓS, L., & ŠPULEROVÁ, J. (2019)。可持续土地利用管理的基本原则。在：MUELLER, L., & EULENSTEIN, F. (编辑。) 景观研究的当前趋势。湛：施普林格，第395-423页。
- [11] JAELANI, A. (2017)。印度尼西亚的清真旅游业：潜力和前景。国际管理和营销评论，7 (3)，25-34。取自
<https://econjournals.com/index.php/irmm/article/view/4352>
- [12] JUMA, L.O. 和 KHADEMI-VIDRA, A. (2019)。以社区为基础的旅游业和肯尼亚农村地区的可持续发展：市民的看法。可持续性，11 (17)，4733。
<https://doi.org/10.3390/su11174733>
- [13] KALA, D. 和 BAGRI, S.C. (2018)。当地社区参与旅游发展的障碍：来自印度北阿坎德邦山区的证据。旅游：国际跨学科期刊，66 (3)，318-333。取自 <https://hrcak.srce.hr/clanak/303072>
- [14] KHALID, S., AHMAD, M. S., RAMAYAH, T., HWANG, J., & KIM, I. (2019)。社区赋权与可持续旅游发展：社区支持旅游的中介作用。可持续性，11 (22)，6248。
<https://doi.org/10.3390/su11226248>
- [15] LEAL FILHO, W., BRANDLI, L.L., BECKER, D., SKANAVIS, C., KOUNANI, A., SARDI, C., PAPAIOANNIDOU, D., PAÇO, A., AZEITEIRO, U., DE SOUSA, L.O., RAATH, S., PRETORIUS, R.W., SHIEL, C., VARGAS, V., TRENCHER, G., & MARANS, R.W. (2018)。可持续发展政策作为大学可持续发展努力的指标和先决条件：事实还是虚构？国际高等教育可持续性杂志，19 (1)，85-113。
<https://doi.org/10.1108/IJSHE-01-2017-0002>
- [16] MANAF, A., PURBASARI, N., DAMAYANTI, M., APRILIA, N., & ASTUTI, W. (2018)。跨组织合作中的以社区为基础的乡村旅游：它如何可持续地运作？从印度尼西亚日惹古农吉杜尔昂朗格兰摄政旅游村汲取的经验教训。可持续性，10(7)，2142。
<https://doi.org/10.3390/su10072142>
- [17] MARTINI, U., BUFFA, F., & NOTARO, S. (2017)。社区参与、自然资源管理和创新旅游产品的创造：来自意大利阿尔卑斯山保护区网络的证据。可持续性，9 (12)，2314。
<https://doi.org/10.3390/su9122314>
- [18] 马丁斯，M. (2018年)。旅游规划和旅游恐惧症：对巴塞罗那2010-2015年战略旅游计划的分析。旅游、遗产与服务营销杂志，4(1)，3-7。
<http://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.1247519>
- [19] NUGROHO, K., CARDEN, F., & ANTLOV, H. (2018)。地方知识很重要：印度尼西亚的权力、背景和制定政策。布里斯托：政策出版社。
<http://doi.org/10.1332/policypress/9781447348078.01.0001>
- [20] PAN, S.Y., GAO, M., KIM, H., SHAH, K.J., PEI, S.L., & CHIANG, P.C. (2018年)。可持续旅游业迈向绿色经济的进展和挑战。整体环境科学，635，452-469。
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2018.04.134>
- [21] PERSSON, J., JOHANSSON, E.L. 和 OLSSON, L. (2018年)。利用当地知识生产科学知识：循证可持续性研究中的挑战和陷阱。生态与社会，23(4)，38。
<https://doi.org/10.5751/ES-10608-230438>
- [22] PFADENHAUER, L.M., GERHARDUS, A., MOZYGEMBA, K., LYS DAHL, K.B., BOOTH, A., HOFMANN, B., WAHLSTER, P., POLUS, S., BURNS, J., BRERETON, L., & REHFUESS, E. (2017)。理解背景和实施中的复杂性：复杂干预的背景和实施 (CICI) 框架。实施科学，12(1)，21。
<https://doi.org/10.1186/s13012-017-0552-5>
- [23] RACHMAWATI, E. 和 FOUNTAIN, J. (2020)。外部利益相关者在旅游业发展和社区赋权中的作用。国际旅游与活动应用科学杂志，4 (1)，25-36。
<http://dx.doi.org/10.31940/ijaste.v4i1.1640>
- [24] RASOOLIMANESH, S.M. 和 JAAFAR, M. (2016)。居民对旅游发展的看法：发展前的视角

- 。地方管理与发展杂志，9（1），91-104。
<https://doi.org/10.1108/JPMD-10-2015-0045>
- [25] RATANAPONGTRA, T., KHAMKERD, T., KONGDIT, S., & NAWATNATEE, T. (2020)。泰国地方身份的价值创造：加强社区文化旅游的营销推广。国际创新、创造力和变革杂志，13（6），475-488。取自 https://www.ijicc.net/images/vol_13/Iss_6/13649_Ratanapongtra_2020_E_R.pdf
- [26] WAHYUNINGRUM, I.F.S., OKTAVILIA, S. 和 UTAMI, S. (2020)。开发旅游潜力：来自塞马维斯夜市的证据。西南交通大学学报，55（6）。
<https://doi.org/10.35741/issn.0258-2724.55.6.16>
- [27] WANG, N., FANG, M., BEAUCHAMP, M., JIA, Z., & ZHOU, Z. (2021)。以土著知识为基础的山村可持续景观：中国贵州嘉滨梯田。人居国际，111，102360。
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.habitatint.2021.102360>
- [28] WONDIRAD, A. 和 EWNETU, B. (2019)。社区参与旅游发展作为在国家公园环境中促进可持续土地和资源利用实践的工具。土地使用政策，88，104155。
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.landusepol.2019.104155>
- [29] WU, C.C., & TSAI, H.M. (2016)。嵌套社会-生态系统中的旅游发展能力建设——以台湾澎湖南部海洋国家公园为例。海洋与海岸管理，123，66-73。
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ocecoaman.2016.02.001>